June 2010

## Building and sustaining leadership capability: a training college case study

Brett Dale<sup>1</sup>

### **Abstract**

This paper reports on case research undertaken at a training college located within Australia to identify the leadership capability of its managers, to determine if there were deficiencies that needed to be addressed and to consider how the College might respond with appropriate policies and action. In terms of the required management and leadership capabilities, the research found that the managers identified significant gaps in their required level of proficiency for leadership roles compared to their actual level of proficiency held at the time of research. In particular, the study found that all managers rated their actual level of proficiency as 'low' under areas relating to business acumen, where they considered the required level as 'high' to 'very high'. It also identified that their management skill discrepancy can be linked directly to the lack of formal professional development in the area of leadership and management. A staff survey identified significant management and leadership actions that were contrary to the College's Strategic Plan. The consensus was that the leadership style was inconsistent with the adult environment and often referred to as 'school teacher' style.. This particular finding portrayed an authoritarian approach to leadership which may have evolved from their previous roles as teachers and trainers. This finding was not identified during the literature research and is an original finding in the field of Vocational Education and Training (VET) leadership capability.

**Keywords:** leadership, leadership capabilities, training college

### Introduction

An investigation of leadership capability in an Australian based training college was undertaken to identify the best approach for building and sustaining leadership capability in the organisation. Because the aim of the research was to gain insight into the conditions required to achieve effective contemporary leadership in the College, and strategies to ensure its continuation in future years, the research focused on the processes of leadership combined with the characteristics of individual leaders.

This report has three parts. First, it describes the theory of leadership and management development. It then describes the research activities that were used in the study and then

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> VET practitioner with extensive middle and senior management experience across both the public and private sectors.

examines how leadership and management were observed in the college. The findings of the research are discussed in relation to the college and how these results related to the theory of leadership and management development. The report concludes with recommendations for the development of leadership and management capacity within the College and strategies for future leaders that will build and sustain leadership capability within the organisation.

#### Literature review

While leadership is believed to be one of the most researched areas of business, with a purported three hundred and fifty documented definitions relating to leadership, it remains one of the least understood aspects of management (Daft 2002). The varied definitions can help one appreciate the multitude of influences which impact on leadership as well as the many perspectives from which it is viewed (Hughes, Ginnett & Curphy 2006). Leadership can be considered as the process of influencing an organised group towards accomplishing its goals (Roach and Behling 1984) and is best understood as being a holistic process that is relevant to the situation and those involved.

For this study of the College and the wider context within the VET sector, this research will use the comprehensive definition accepted by Callan et al. (2007):

The capacity at both the individual and institutional levels to: identify and define organizational goals and the desired outcomes; develop strategies and plans to achieve those goals and deliver those outcomes; guide the organisation and motivate people in reaching those goals and outcomes. To do this requires energy, commitment, persistence, integrity, intelligence and a capacity to inspire from the leader and the encouragement of these attributes from the organisation.

Throughout the literature, the leading school of thought regarding leadership appears to be the transformational model. This model relies on change and the leader's direct influence on the individual employee's motivation and performance. Transformational leadership is emerging as a preferred model on the basis of the role the leader plays in promoting both personal and organizational change, in particular the role they have in supporting staff to meet and exceed expectations about performance (Callan et al 2007). Although extensive research exists on transformational leadership (Bass 1996; Bass & Avolio 1993, 1994; Bernard 1999; Yammarino & Bass 1990), little extant research exists regarding its place in the VET sector.

The research focus examined the management and leadership capabilities of all those in leadership roles within the College and not solely the VET leadership team. This approach aligns closely with the research reported by Callan et al (2007) who further describe transformational leadership as being comprised of at least four interrelated behaviours or sets of actions:

- **Inspirational stimulation,** articulating an appealing and evocative vision about what the organisation aims to achieve and how it wants to serve its customers and related stakeholders
- **Intellectual stimulation,** promoting opportunities and organizational cultures of creativity and innovation among staff

- **Idealized influence,** providing a role model for staff at all levels
- **Individualised consideration,** engaging in coaching and mentoring roles that empower staff.

Furthermore, common theme throughout the literature about characteristics of transformational leaders are (Avolio 2005):

- Transformational leaders are judged by their subordinates as more effective leaders.
- Transformational leaders exist at all levels of the organisation.
- The more transformational leadership exists at the higher levels in the organisation, the more it is seen in the lower levels, including in the teams.

In turn, Falk and Smith (2003) found that effective transformational leaders build positive psychological states and emotional capital among their employees. Emotionally intelligent leaders and managers who are transformational in their style are able to switch their leadership style to adapt to the needs of the particular environment, using appropriate authoritative, democratic, and coaching styles due to their higher levels of self-awareness, their ability to read a situation, and their adaptability.

This concept of emotional intelligence (Goleman 1998, 2000) refers to emotionally intelligent leaders that manage themselves and their relationships effectively. In particular, they display sets of transformational behaviours that demonstrate self-awareness, self-management, social awareness and social skills. Leaders with higher emotionally intelligence are more able to switch styles at appropriate times. Transformational leaders are known to establish more intellectually stimulating workplaces, which in turn foster more openness, creativity and a willingness by their employees to challenge the status quo (Callan et al 2007). Detailed research across the VET sector has made claim to not only the presence of transformational leadership, but rather the demand for it in this rapid pace of change. Increasingly, emotional intelligence has become a requirement for the development of leaders and managers.

Developmental opportunities are learning opportunities that give managers the knowledge and skills to enable the organisation to achieve its strategic objective. They enhance capability and facilitate positive change and innovation. Capable managers are more confident and effective in dealing with their often complex and demanding jobs (Falk and Smith 2003). Furthermore they display higher levels of job satisfaction, commitment and engagement. Organisations with a strong commitment to management and leadership development find that the returns are positive and high, in terms of organizational productivity, organizational learning, continuous improvement, quality and customer service (Callan et al 2007). In addition, management and leadership development has benefits that extend beyond the organisation and into the broader community.

Leadership and management development is now considered to be one of the key organisational processes intended to deliver successful organisational adaptation and renewal. The view that management development is a strategic activity, and that the development of managers is critical to the development of the organisation as a whole, is now well established (Garavan, Barnicle & O'Suilleabhain 1999).

### **Research setting**

On the foundation above, this research aimed to do case research at a training college located within Australia to identify the leadership capability of its managers, to determine if there were deficiencies that needed to be addressed and to consider how the College might respond with appropriate policies and action. In other words, the research objective was to identify the best approaches for building and sustaining leadership capability in the College to achieve further competitive advantage and market sustainability.

The College used in this case study is one of the larger private automotive training providers in Australia having sixty percent of the market share of the State's demand where it delivers training on light vehicle mechanical and electrical trade training. The business has a \$6m annual turnover with a \$1.8m net profit and an average annual growth rate of twenty three percent over the past three years. The College has in recent times undergone major changes aimed at creating capacity to manage growth and provide a culture promoting lifelong learning that values the contribution of its staff.

Within the College, a systematic approach to professional development of staff is described in the HR Manual which covers training needs and gap analysis, together with a framework to develop its staff. The HR Manual details overarching priorities, professional development activities and a number of options available to staff including partial and full financial support for attendance at formal courses, and time off to attend conferences and other training programmes. The HR Manual does not articulate a specific leadership style and although the College maintains staff profiles that conform to the requirements of the Australian Quality Training Framework (AQTF), the professional development plans do not link to any position descriptions, career mapping or professional development pathways.

The college has reached a critical milestone in its evolution and growth as a dominant VET provider and the challenges of growth dictate careful planning to ensure its ongoing success and sustainability. One of the planning gaps identified in a recent SWOT analysis of the College was the need for more effective leadership. The results identified that the leadership competence of the management team was a high risk which threatened the continued growth and sustainability of the organization. Consequently, this research provided an opportunity for the organisation to identify the motivators and strategies that will contribute to building and sustaining leadership capability in the College.

### Methodology

A single case study methodology was used to collect research relating to building and sustaining leadership capability in the College. The case study method offers a proven tool for achieving a profound understanding of a specific trend or experience. Although the case study method has been dismissed by critics who question the rigor of the approach, numerous studies over the past twenty years have demonstrated that the case study method successfully probes beneath the surface of a situation (Saunders, Lewis & Thornhill 2007). To achieve the breadth and depth of understanding the research, both quantitative and qualitative research methods were used. Interviews and surveys were used as the data collection methods and enabled an analysis of leadership capability within the College; an

insight into the perceptions of leadership; and the variations of required leadership proficiency compared with actual leadership performance of managers.

### Research method

The research involved semi structured interviews of five managers from the College, two females and three males representing the administrative, technical and support divisions. The gender ratio within the College is sixty seven males to seventeen females with a total of six male and three female managers. The interview sample included two female administrative managers, two male technical managers and one male support manager. A copy of the interview guide is included at Appendix A.

In addition to the interviews, two surveys were used to gather research data. In the first survey, the managers volunteered to participate in a leadership proficiency evaluation using a management and leadership capability profile which analysed the variation between the required level of proficiency and the actual level being achieved in the role from their perspective. The survey was created using a number of tools located on the National Centre for Vocational Education Research (NCVER) website that were designed specifically to evaluate management and leadership development. A copy of the survey is included at Appendix B and was modified using a scale of 1-6 rather than 1-9 as indicated on the instructions page

The second survey was conducted with a focus group of ten subordinates to gather the views and opinions of the staff relating to their managers. This research was conducted in a single group session and was used as a cross checking forum against existing policy and the first survey of managers. This survey was designed to evaluate the leadership proficiency of managers from the subordinate's perspective using a selection of measures taken from the leadership proficiency survey and more particularly identifiable to junior staff. A copy of the general staff survey is included at Appendix C.

The eighty four College staff range in age from twenty one to fifty six years of age, with ninety percent being Australian. Less than fifteen percent hold tertiary qualifications, with sixty five percent holding at least one vocational qualification of certificate III or above, normally a combination of technical trade qualifications and a training and assessment qualification. The selection of managers in the interviews and survey was based on achieving equilibrium of gender and areas of business across the College (with at least one manager from each department). The same five managers participated in both the management and leadership capability proficiency profile and the leadership development survey. Likewise, two subordinates from each department participated and where possible, they varied in age and gender. The total sample of managers was sixty percent whereas the sample of subordinates was limited to fifteen percent. The interviews ranged in duration from thirty to fifty minutes and were conducted back to back over one day. The surveys were issued to the managers to complete over a five day period to encourage maximum input and the subordinate cross check survey was completed in a group setting lasting one hour.

The reliability of the manager responses was considered high because the five managers were selected on their potential as recognised by the CEO of the College and each of them actively volunteered to participate. The reliability of the cross checking forum may have some limitations because the selection was not necessarily representative of all College staff and the group setting may have influenced some individual responses.

## **Research findings**

Managing complexity was seen by the managers as one of the challenges that closely listed those described in previous reports (Callan et al 2007; Mitchell et al 2003). A major obstacle for managers and staff involves adjusting to the demands of change and the increasing complexity of their management responsibilities. Participants viewed the role of leaders to be about giving a sense of direction to the organisation and setting an appealing vision for the future.

The challenges of change were often multiplied when managers were typically required to respond in difficult circumstances. Two managers reported that the constant change of Federal and State Government funding models created frequent and detrimental business changes due to poor consultation with stakeholders.

The subordinate responses suggested that change was implemented without consultation or reference to existing internal policy. Three respondents thought that the managers hid behind government policy when making decisions relating to change typified by the respondent who claimed:

We were made to change the whole process for new enrolments because our manager came up with a process that was not well thought out and when she realised it was not as good as she thought, she told us the process was implemented to conform to the State policy.

A factor driving the complexity was the wide range of stakeholders expecting more flexibility and customisation of their training product. Additionally, managers were required to manage their staff internally and at the same time coordinate industry placements and vacancies created from these additional demands. One of the technical managers described this challenge:

We need to communicate closely with our employers to understand their need. The challenge is to persuade trainers to become more learner-centred. My leadership skills need to extend beyond the College, I need to be able to communicate and influence industry support.

Business acumen was one aspect unanimously reported by the managers as needing improvement. For this study, the term **business acumen** is defined as a concept pertaining to a person's knowledge and ability to make profitable business decisions. This is a literal definition taken from the Oxford Dictionary using the two composite words 'business' and 'acumen. For example, within the College, business acumen may include the ability of the manager to develop cost effective, innovative training delivery model that is in high demand by industry. The managers all expressed low levels of confidence about their business acumen and among the five managers that were interviewed; none identified themselves as having the competence for the responsibility and accountability of their division. They remain dependent on the CEO and CFO to initiate strategic business initiatives, particularly those that are external to the organisation. Callan et al (2007) have mentioned the scarcity of true entrepreneurs in the VET sector, the lack of support and rewards they receive for their efforts and, ultimately, their sense of burnout. One manager failed to acknowledge the need for business acumen, saying:

I am very comfortable that my skill contribution to the College is appropriate for the current operation and the future from where I see it today. The CEO is ultimately responsible for the business accountability and it is he who should remain business savvy. I would feel that my role would suffer if I focused on the commercial operation of the College.

The subordinates all reported that their managers did not manage the financial performance of the company and that this was left to the CEO who reported the financial position to the Board. They view the managers as having major responsibilities, but not for all aspects of the business. One respondent described the situation with an analogy:

My manager is a bit like my dad, he looks after parts of the house and other stuff at home, but in the end mum will decide what happens - I guess the CEO is mum here!

The capabilities required of managers calls for a focus on the strategic objectives and the needs of industry, more than ever before (*Queensland Skills Plan* 2008). Operational issues remain important and working closely with industry is also fundamental to continued growth and business success. Due to the growth in size of the College, an increasingly important imperative for the managers is to maintain a focus on service and support. It was reported that managers need to be more aware that teaching and learning are seen as the core business and that the peripherals must fully support these activities so that it can generate business.

## As one manager said:

It is not our business systems that are the most important in our organisation, but how our internal support staff contribute to our 'core business' of learning.

## Another manager summarised his views:

There is a gap between the administrative and teaching managers. We need greater collaboration so that we can avoid duplication and share what I view as an imbalance in workloads. We don't have the business acumen to run the commercial aspects of the company and frankly it takes us away from our core business of training.

During the interviews, the managers expressed the opinion that the greatest factors impacting on their work in the coming years will be new technology, more competitive training environments, and further changes to funding. It was felt by subordinates that some managers found the concept of internal support difficult to comprehend and there were some suggestions that managers need to offer more support to the staff on the 'road and floor'. This was seen by the subordinates as a major obstacle, and one requiring the managers to resolve before their full leadership role could be appreciated. One respondent claimed:

Sometimes I feel that I have to hide the work that I am doing for the trainer from my manager so that he and I do not get into trouble - I really struggle with limiting what support I can give him - it's like being at school again - I am not cheating I just want to help but the teacher doesn't see it that way - so much for being an adult!

Throughout the interviews, most managers agreed that they needed to be more business focused, willing to engage at a more strategic level with their staff and the CEO. They felt that they needed to be more innovative in their application of leadership and management skills and felt that they are only applying what they did five to ten years ago, but without achieving the same effect. One manager expressed this frustration by claiming:

I want to do what is best for my staff and the College but it is becoming more difficult. I feel that they do not respond and see things as difficult... a huge issue for the trainers I manage... especially those who have been with us for a while. They do not comprehend the nature of a competitive environment where the threat of losing business is real.

### Results and discussion

The leadership capability profiles for all managers have shown a great disparity between the required levels of proficiency to that of the perceived level held by the managers. The research focused on the following nine capabilities:

- Corporate vision and direction
- Strategic focus
- Achieves outcomes
- Develops and manages resources
- Change leadership
- Interpersonal relationships
- Personal development and mastery
- Business and entrepreneurial skills
- Develops and empowers

The five managers rated their current proficiency level with these nine capabilities using a six point scale:

- 1 = None
- 2 = Low
- 3 = Some
- 4 = Moderate
- 5 = High
- 6 = Very High

They rated themselves as being up to four levels below the required proficiency to do the job, whilst only two capabilities were rated equal to the required and actual level of proficiencies. These two capabilities of **interpersonal relations** and **achieves outcomes** were rated in the mid range level of skills.

The five critical findings were all related to the core business functions that were also evident in survey responses, these being: business and entrepreneurial skills; change leadership; corporate vision and direction; develops and manages resources; and focuses strategically. These five capabilities were rated by all participants as requiring a high to very high level of leadership capability proficiencies, whereas the average response for actual proficiency was 'some'. A summary of the results is shown in Table 1 and indicates the wide discrepancy between the leadership competencies required for the College management positions and the proficiency levels reported by the managers.

While the managers acknowledged their own shortcomings, the comments provided in the subordinate survey indicated further discrepancies between the manager's satisfaction in proficiency and the subordinate's observations. A subordinate commented:

One of the biggest issues is that our managers are not technically savvy – this limits their innovation and kind of prevents them from listening to what we might say.... It's because they are not comfortable with the technology. Sometimes it is them that are the road block.

The proficiency profile identified a deficit in actual proficiencies of thirty five percent below the level considered necessary to perform their current role. Several subordinate respondents reinforced this finding by relating their observation to being 'teachers' acting as managers:

I think they try their best, but really they are not trained business people or managers really and when I compare them to managers I have worked for in other roles... they are so different and more like my high school teacher than my manager.

Table 1 Summary of manager proficiency ratings

| Capability                          | Required | Actual | Proficient | Rating<br>average<br>required for<br>proficiency | Rating<br>average for<br>actual<br>proficiency |
|-------------------------------------|----------|--------|------------|--|--|
| Personal development and mastery    | 74       | 42     | 57%        | Very high  | Moderate                                       |
| Business and entrepreneurial skills | 22       | 12     | 55%        | Vey High   | Some   |
| Develops and empowers others        | 24       | 14     | 59%        | High   | Some+  |
| Achieves<br>outcomes                | 23       | 21     | 91%        | Moderate   | Some   |
| Corporate vision and direction      | 42       | 22     | 52%        | Very high+                                       | Some   |
| Focuses strategically               | 54       | 33     | 61%        | Very high+                                       | Moderate                                       |
| Develops and manages resources      | 54       | 46     | 85%        | Very high  | High   |
| Change<br>leadership                | 54       | 31     | 58%        | Very high+                                       | Some+  |
| Interpersonal skills                | 26       | 18     | 70%        | Very high  | Moderate+                                      |

Source: analysis of survey data.

The results indicate that there is much that needs to be done within the College to improve the leadership competency levels of the managers, despite the recognition that leadership and management development is a strategic activity, and that the development of managers is critical to the development of the organisation as a whole (Garavan, Barnicle & O'Suilleabhain 1999). The need for leadership development to be linked to performance requirements in the workplace (Turcato 1998) and for management learning to be pragmatic and located within the organisational context and reality (Beckett 1998) is supported by the comments made by managers and subordinates in the College. These findings lead to a number of recommendations affecting leadership and management development at the College.

Based on the leadership capability profile results, an immediate priority should be to develop the existing management to the level of capability required to effectively lead and manage the business and its people. The succession plan for future leaders will also need to deliver a learning and development strategy for the College to build and sustain leadership capability.

The research found that the managers have significant gaps in the required level of proficiency for leadership roles. In particular, the study found that all managers rated their actual level of proficiency as 'low' under areas relating to business acumen, where they considered the required level as 'high' to 'very high'. The research findings relating to their skill discrepancy can be directly linked to the lack of formal professional development in the area of leadership and management within the College.

### Recommendations and actions for the future

As a result of the findings from the interviews, surveys and the literature review, the following strategies are presented for building and sustaining leadership capability in the College:

- Conduct a training needs analysis on existing managers and develop a customised intensive leadership and management development program that aligns with a contemporary leadership framework suitable for a VET environment (transformational leadership style).
- Formalise a leadership and development program for all staff linked to career progression pathways. This will communicate a common language about what should be identified to effectively develop as leaders at various levels, and will deliver a more strategic approach to designing professional development requirements and activities for staff at varying career points.
- Continue to promote efforts to request financial support for external development opportunities, and to support staff in terms of study time. These opportunities need to be considered earlier in the manager's career to enable effective transition from teaching to managing. There must be a focus on business acumen, including change management, innovation and human resource management.
- Develop succession plans that include senior executive key leadership development programs that meet the specific need of the College. This may include

individual qualifications (MBA) or specific groups attending programs that promote organisational learning objectives. In terms of staff retention, these opportunities should be recognised as career progression initiatives that aim to result in promotion and financial reward.

- The College should consider alliances that may result in partnerships with other non competitive VET organisations. This may involve different levels of management and provide learning opportunity that relates to the broader VET sector and could be used to resolve complex management issues.
- Develop human capital procurement strategies that will import business acumen to the College. This strategy could potentially import external knowledge and skills that would address the existing gaps in business acumen and leadership at management levels.

#### Conclusion

In summary, this paper reports on case research undertaken at a training college within Australia to identify the leadership capability of its managers, to determine if there were deficiencies that needed to be addressed and to consider how the College might respond with appropriate policies and action. In terms of the required management and leadership capabilities, the research found that the managers identified significant gaps in their required level of proficiency for leadership roles compared to their actual level of proficiency held at the time of research. In particular, the study found that all managers rated their actual level of proficiency as 'low' under areas relating to business acumen, where they considered the required level as 'high' to 'very high'. It also identified that their management skill discrepancy can be linked directly to the lack of formal professional development in the area of leadership and management. A staff survey identified significant management and leadership actions that were contrary to the College's Strategic Plan.

In conclusion, the consensus was that the leadership style was inconsistent with the adult environment and often referred to as 'school teacher' style. All participants indicated that they believed the managers had the best intentions in their responsibility to their staff, however only ten percent believed that their manager had the skills to lead and manage them effectively in a contemporary environment. This particular finding portrayed an authoritarian approach to leadership which may have evolved from their previous roles as teachers and trainers. This finding was not identified during the literature research and is an original finding in the field of Vocational Education and Training (VET) leadership capability.

### References

Avolio, BJ 2005, *Leadership development in balance: Made/born*, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Manwah, HJ.

Bass, BM 1996, 'Is there universality in the full range model of leadership?', *International Journal of Public Administration*, vol. 19, no. 6, p. 731.

Bass, BM & Avolio, BJ 1993, 'Transformational leadership and organizational culture', *Public Administration Quarterly*, vol. 17, no. 1, p. 112.

Bernard, MB 1999, 'Ethics, character, and authentic transformational leadership behavior', *Leadership Quarterly*, vol. 10, no. 2, p. 181.

Bennis, W. 2004). The Seven Ages of the Leader. Harvard Business Review, 46-53.

Callan, VJ 2001, What are the essential capabilities requested for those who manage training organisations?, NCVER, Adelaide.

Callan V, Mitchell, J, Clayton, B, & Smith, L, 2007, Approaches for sustaining and building management and leadership capability in VET Providers. NCVER, Adelaide.

Dickie, M, Eccles, C, Fitzgerald, L, McDonald, R, Cully, M, Blythe, A, Stanwick, J & Brooks, L 2004, *Enhancing the capability of VET professionals project: Final report*, ANTA, Brisbane.

Daft, R. L. (2002). The Leadership Experience. (2. Edition, Ed.) Ohio: Thomas Learning.

Falk, I & Smith, T 2003, Leadership in vocational education and training: leadership by design, not default. NCVER, Adelaide.

Finch-Lees, T, Mabey, C, & Liefooghe, A 2005, 'In the name of capability: A critical discursive evaluation of competency-based management development', *Human Relations*, no.58, pp.1185–223.

Foley, J & Canole, L 2003, A draft leadership capability framework to assist leadership development in the Victorian TAFE sector, Victorian Department of Education and Training, Melbourne.

Garavan, TN, Barnicle, B & O'Suilleabhain, F, 1999, *Management development: Contemporary trends issues and strategies*. Journal of European Industrial Training, Vol 23 Issue 4/5 pp. 191-207.

Goffee, R & Jones, G 2006, Why should anyone be led by you?, Harvard Business School Press, Boston.

Goleman, D 1995, *Emotional intelligence: Why it can matter more than IQ*, Bloomsbury, London.

Goleman, D 1998, Working with emotional intelligence. Bantam, New York.

Goleman, D 2000, 'Leadership that gets results' Harvard Business Review, March-April, pp. 78-90

Goshal, S, Bartlett, CA & Moran, P 1999, 'A new manifesto for management', *Sloan Management Review*, no.40, pp.9–20.

Gosling, J., & Mintzberg, H. (2003). The Five Minds of a Manager. *Harvard Business Review*, 54-63.

Guthrie, H 2004, *The vocational education and training workforce: New roles and ways of working*, NCVER, Adelaide.

Hughes, R. L., Ginnett, R. C., & Curphy, G. J. (2006). *Leadership Enhancing the Lessons of Experience* (5th Edition ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill Irwin.

Hunt, JG 2004, 'What is leadership?', in *The nature of leadership*, eds J Antonakis, AT Cianciolo & R Sternberg, Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA, pp.19–47.

Kouzes, J & Posner, B 2002, The leadership challenge, Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.

Mabey, C & Ramirez, M 2004, *Developing managers: A European perspective*, Chartered Management Institute, London.

Mitchell, J 2002a, *The never-ending quest: Effective strategy-making and change management for high-performing VET organisations*, ANTA, Melbourne.

Mitchell, J, Clayton, B, Hedberg, J & Paine, N 2003, *Emerging futures: Innovation in teaching and learning in VET*, ANTA, Melbourne.

Mitchell, J, McKenna, S, Perry, W & Bald, C 2005, *New ways of working in VET*, ANTA, Melbourne.

Mulcahy, D 2003, *Leadership and management in vocational education and training: Staying focused on strategy*, volume 1, NCVER, Adelaide.

Sankar, Y. (2003). Character and Not Charisma is the Critical Measure of Leadership Excellence. *The Journal of Leadership and Organisational Studies*, 45-55.

Saunders, M, Lewis, P & Thornhill, A, Research Methods for Business Students (4<sup>th</sup> edn), London: Pearson Education Limited

Yammarino, FJ & Bass, BM 1990, 'Transformational Leadership and Multiple Levels of Analysis', *Human Relations*, vol. 43, no. 10, p. 975.

Yukl, G. A. (2002). *Leadership in Organisations* (2nd Edition ed.). New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

## Appendix A

### **Manager Survey:**

This survey has been adapted from the tools used by the NCVER to meet the objectives of the research question. This research is examining: the leadership and management development efforts that are being used or that are planned to be used for building and sustaining the capabilities of College staff who engage in managing and leading people as part of their role.

### **Informed consent:**

The researcher for this project is following the ethical guidelines issues by GLG as a criterion of the research project.

- No individuals will be identified in this report.
- Opinions will be incorporated under major themes
- The organisations will not be identified
- All interview notes will be summarized and destroyed at the end of the project
- The results of the research will be available to all participants early 2009

| <b>Opening question</b> Q. As you look to the future in terms of the management and leadership talent required for   |
|--|
| the College to continue to be competitive and innovative in the VET sector, what are the three most pressing leadership and management issues that are facing:   |
| 1  |
| 2  |
| 3  |
| Specific areas for management and leadership development Q. In your opinion, for the teaching staff who engage in management and leadership roles, the College is <u>most focused</u> about developing their management and leadership capabilities in the three areas of: |
| 1  |
| 2  |
| Q. In your opinion, for the administration and learning support staff who engage in management and leadership roles, the College is <b>most focused</b> about developing their management and leadership capabilities in three areas of:  1.                               |
| 2  |
| 3  |
| In terms of management and leadership development, what is occurring at present, or what is planned and what policy does the College have on professional development?   |
| Major achievements to date in management and leadership development Q. What are you proud of, and can point to as a major achievement in leadership and management development for either yourself, a colleague?   |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
| Q. Are you facing a generational change of management in your division or another division that you are familiar with in the next five years?  Yes / No  |
| If yes, how is the College (you and others) planning to respond to such changes - including succession planning for various types of staff.  |

| Q. Do you apply/follow any of the following policies to your management role at the College: the human resource management plan, the strategic plan, or plans to use to sustain across the organisation its management and leadership capabilities? Yes / No |
|--|
| Q. At present, what are <b>the biggest constraints</b> that you need to deal with in building the management and leadership capability of your staff?  |
|  |
| Q. What contemporary leadership and management practices or development do you or others in the College use that you would <u>rate as effective or better</u> ?  |
|  |

## Appendix B

## **Management and Leadership Capability Profile**

**Instructions:** Listed in this survey are various management and leadership capabilities. For each management and leadership capability, you will be asked two questions. Firstly, please consider the level of proficiency you believe is **required** to perform your current leadership and management roles effectively. Insert a number from 1-6 in the box provided. Participants are advised to ignore the scale of 1-9 on the survey tool developed by NCVER.

**Commencement:** Using the scale to the right, for each item listed below; please indicate the level of proficiency you believe is required to perform your current role effectively. Then indicate the actual level of proficiency you feel you now exhibit in doing your role.

| Requi | red Level of Proficiency | Actual Level of Proficiency |           |  |  |  |
|-------|--------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------|--|--|--|
| 1.    | Not Required             | 1.                          | None      |  |  |  |
| 2.    | Low Level Required       | 2.                          | Low       |  |  |  |
| 3.    | Some Level Required      | 3.                          | Some      |  |  |  |
| 4.    | Moderate Level           | 4.                          | Moderate  |  |  |  |
| 5.    | High Level Required      | 5.                          | High      |  |  |  |
| 6.    | Very High Level Required | 6.                          | Very High |  |  |  |

| Using the scale to the right, for each item listed below, please indicate the level of proficiency you believe is required to perform your current role effectively. Then indicate the actual level of proficiency you feel you now exhibit in doing your role. | Required Level of  1. Not Required 2. Low Level Req 3. Some Level Red 4. Moderate Level 5. High Level Red 6. Very High Level 7. Extremely High Required 9. Not Relevant | 1. uired 2. squired 3. I 4. quired 5. el Required 6. Level 7. | ual Level of Proficiency  None Low Some Moderate High Very High Extremely High Not Relevant |
|---|---|---|---|
| The First Capability is <u>CORP</u>   |   | DIRECTION   |   |
|   | Re  | quired Level of<br>Proficiency                                | Actual Level of<br>Proficiency  |
| <ul> <li>Promotes and communicat<br/>vision for the organisation</li> </ul>   | tes a clear   |   |   |
| Effectively involves people<br>how to achieve the vision  | in determining  |   |   |
| Builds a successful corpora   | ate team  |   |   |
| <ul> <li>Establishes clear expectati<br/>the level of performance re<br/>team members to achieve</li> </ul>   | equired of  |   |   |
| <ul> <li>Inspires people to commit t<br/>the vision</li> </ul>  | to achieving  |   |   |
| <ul> <li>Develops an effective strate<br/>achieving the vision</li> </ul>   | egy at  |   |   |
| <ul> <li>Supports the vision of leader<br/>above them in the organisa</li> </ul>  |   |   |   |
| The Second Capability is FO   | CUSSES STRATEG  | ICALLY  |   |
|   | Re  | equired Level of<br>Proficiency                               | Actual Level of<br>Proficiency  |
| <ul> <li>Envisages future trends an<br/>on the organisation</li> </ul>  | nd their impact   |   |   |
| <ul> <li>Undertakes effective strate<br/>and reviews</li> </ul>   | egic analysis   |   |   |
| <ul> <li>Advocates strategic initiative the organisation ahead of it</li> </ul>   |   |   |   |
| <ul> <li>Demonstrates a comprehe<br/>understanding of the VET s<br/>how new government initia<br/>potentially impact upon the</li> </ul>  | sector, and<br>itives   |   |   |
|   |   |   |   |

|                                   |   | Required Leve  |  | ACI  | •  |
|-----------------------------------|---|--|--|--|--|
| inc<br>yo<br>pe<br>ef<br>ac<br>fe | sing the scale to the right, for ich item listed below, please dicate the level of proficiency u believe is required to inform your current role fectively. Then indicate the stual level of proficiency you let you now exhibit in doing our role.   | <ol> <li>Moderate L</li> <li>High Level</li> </ol>   | Required<br>el Required<br>Level<br>Required<br>Level Required<br>High Level | 1.<br>2.<br>3.<br>4.<br>5.<br>6.<br>7.<br>9. | None<br>Low<br>Some<br>Moderate<br>High<br>Very High<br>Extremely High<br>Not Relevant |
|                                   |   |  | Required Level of<br>Proficiency   |  | Actual Level of<br>Proficiency   |
| •                                 | Evaluates information quick and strategically   | ly, critically   |  |  |  |
| •                                 | Creates a network of relatio that help to get things done   | nships   |  |  |  |
| •                                 | Assesses a range of solutio the easiest option  | ns rather than   |  |  |  |
| •                                 | Makes a decision about the moves matters forward with   |  |  |  |  |
| •                                 | Demonstrates a willingness original solutions which are square'   |  |  |  |  |
| Th                                | e Third Capability is <u>ACHIE</u>  | VES OUTCOM   | <u>ES</u>  |  |  |
|                                   |   |  |  |  |  |
|                                   |   |  | Required Level o<br>Proficiency  | f  | Actual Level of<br>Proficiency   |
| •                                 | Achieves results that lead to value for stakeholders  | o long-term  |  | f  |  |
| •                                 |   | ement by<br>actually   |  | f  |  |
| •                                 | value for stakeholders  Creates a culture of achieve ensuring that new initiatives  | ement by<br>actually<br>s  |  | f  |  |
| •                                 | value for stakeholders  Creates a culture of achieve ensuring that new initiatives produce expected outcome  Sets and monitors clear per  | ement by<br>actually<br>s<br>rformance   |  | f  |  |
| •                                 | value for stakeholders  Creates a culture of achieve ensuring that new initiatives produce expected outcome  Sets and monitors clear perstandards  Inspires others to achieve t   | ement by a actually s actually s are formance the highest congoing onitor the  |  | f  |  |
| •                                 | value for stakeholders  Creates a culture of achieve ensuring that new initiatives produce expected outcome  Sets and monitors clear perstandards  Inspires others to achieve t levels of quality  Develops and implements of evaluation processes to monefficiency, effectiveness and  | ement by a actually so actuall |  | f  |  |
| •                                 | value for stakeholders  Creates a culture of achieve ensuring that new initiatives produce expected outcome  Sets and monitors clear perstandards  Inspires others to achieve t levels of quality  Develops and implements of evaluation processes to mone efficiency, effectiveness and outcomes  Applies a commercial orient organisation by focussing of | ement by a actually so actuall |  | f  |  |

#### Required Level of Proficiency Actual Level of Proficiency Using the scale to the right, for Not Required Low Level Required None each item listed below, please Low indicate the level of proficiency you believe is required to 3. 4. Some Moderate 3. Some Level Required Moderate Level perform your current role effectively. Then indicate the actual level of proficiency you feel you now exhibit in doing 5. High Level Required Very High Level Required High Very High 5 Extremely High Level Required Extremely High Not Relevant your role. Not Relevant The Fourth Capability is <u>DEVELOPS AND MANAGES RESOURCES</u> Required Level of Actual Level of Proficiency Proficiency Converts new ideas into value-added products and services Effectively translates innovative ideas into business results Holds people accountable for results Allocates and manages resources to achieve agreed outcomes Eliminates waste and unneeded cost Applies innovative solutions to gain the full use of the physical and other resources of the institution Implements continuous improvement driven by information available from the institution's performance management processes and systems Overcomes 'road blocks' that reduce the effective use of resources Uses new technology well to increase organisational performance The Fifth Capability is CHANGE LEADERSHIP Required Level of Actual Level of Proficiency Proficiency Alters organisational structures and practices to meet client needs Demonstrates a willingness to seek others' views about new initiatives or changes for the organisation

|  |   | Required Level   | l of Proficiency   | Act  | ual Level of Proficiency   |
|--|---|--|--|--|--|
| ea<br>ind<br>you<br>pe<br>eff<br>ac<br>fee | ing the scale to the right, for chitem listed below, please icate the level of proficiency u believe is required to from your current role ectively. Then indicate the tual level of proficiency you el you now exhibit in doing ur role. | <ol> <li>Not Require</li> <li>Low Level I</li> <li>Some Level</li> <li>Moderate L</li> <li>High Level</li> <li>Very High L</li> <li>Extremely I<br/>Required</li> <li>Not Releval</li> </ol> | Required<br>Il Required<br>Level<br>Required<br>Level Required<br>High Level | 1.<br>2.<br>3.<br>4.<br>5.<br>6.<br>7.<br>9. | None<br>Low<br>Some<br>Moderate<br>High<br>Very High<br>Extremely High<br>Not Relevant |
|  |   |  | Required Level of  |  | Actual Level of  |
| •  | Is confident about using a ra<br>strategies to change the orga<br>culture and value systems   |  | Proficiency  |  | Proficiency  |
| •  | Galvanises others to act on changes   | required   |  |  |  |
| •  | Adopts a planned and stage to the management of change  |  |  |  |  |
| ٠  | Gains the commitment of sta<br>adoption of new practices in<br>of education and training  |  |  |  |  |
| •  | Is able to work with ambiguit uncertainty   | y and  |  |  |  |
| •  | Communicates the need for to staff using a wide range o communication channels an opportunities   | f  |  |  |  |
| •  | Facilitates individuals to wor to identify and achieve comm   |  |  |  |  |
| •  | Is willing to challenge the sy change is needed   | stem when  |  |  |  |
| Th   | e Sixth Capability is <u>INTER</u>  | PERSONAL RE  | ELATIONSHIPS   |  |  |
|  |   |  | Required Level o<br>Proficiency  | f  | Actual Level of<br>Proficiency   |
| •  | Consults and facilitates the opinions in deciding upon a actions, products or service   | opropriate   |  |  |  |
| •  | Negotiates persuasively   |  |  |  |  |
| •  | Liaises and communicates  | effectively  |  |  |  |
| •  | Appreciates the value of div  | erse views   |  |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |  |  |

110

## Using the scale to the right, for each item listed below, please indicate the level of proficiency you believe is required to perform your current role effectively. Then indicate the actual level of proficiency you feel you now exhibit in doing your

role.

#### Required Level of Proficiency

### Not Required

- Not Required
  Low Level Required
  Some Level Required
  Moderate Level
  High Level Required
  Very High Level Required
  Extremely High Level
  Required Required Not Relevant
- 9.

#### Actual Level of Proficiency

- None
   Low
   Some
   Moderate
   High
   Very High
   Extremely High
   Not Relevant

### The Seventh Capability is PERSONAL DEVELOPMENT AND MASTERY

|   |  | Required Level of<br>Proficiency | Actual Level of<br>Proficiency |
|---|--|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| • | Encourages debate that results in others' opinions rather than their own being adopted     |                                  |                                |
| • | Trusts people enough to 'let go'   |                                  |                                |
| • | Is sensitive to differences in the personalities and motivations of staff                  |                                  |                                |
| • | Demonstrates personal integrity and applies ethical practices                              |                                  |                                |
| • | Deeply understands their strengths and weaknesses  |                                  |                                |
| • | Recognises and addresses areas for personal development to be a better manager and leader  |                                  |                                |
| • | As a team player, knows when to lead and when to follow                                    |                                  |                                |
| • | Admits to mistakes and errors of judgment  |                                  |                                |
| • | Demonstrates self-confidence as a leader   |                                  |                                |
| • | Recognises and accepts the need to seek support and help in their professional development |                                  |                                |
| • | Shows appropriate emotional responses in a variety of situations                           |                                  |                                |
| • | Has the technological knowledge needed to succeed in tomorrow's world                      |                                  |                                |
|   |  |                                  |                                |
|   |  |                                  |                                |
|   |  |                                  |                                |

|                                    |   | Red                              | quired Leve   | el of Proficiency  | Ac                         | tual Level of Proficiency  |
|------------------------------------|---|----------------------------------|---|--|----------------------------|--|
| e:<br>yu<br><u>p</u> :<br>a:<br>fe | sing the scale to the right, for ach item listed below, please dicate the level of proficiency by believe is required to enform your current role ffectively. Then indicate the ctual level of proficiency you let you now exhibit in doing your ble.   | 2.<br>3.<br>4.<br>5.<br>6.<br>7. | Not Requir<br>Low Level<br>Some Level<br>Moderate L<br>High Level<br>Very High I<br>Extremely I<br>Required<br>Not Releva | Required<br>el Required<br>.evel<br>Required<br>.evel Required<br>High Level | 3.<br>4.<br>5.<br>6.<br>7. | None<br>Low<br>Some<br>Moderate<br>High<br>Very High<br>Extremely High<br>Not Relevant |
| Th                                 | e Eighth Capability is <u>BUSIN</u>   | ESS                              | AND EN  | <u> </u>   | SK                         | ILLS   |
|                                    |   |                                  |   | Required Level of<br>Proficiency   |                            | Actual Level of<br>Proficiency   |
| •                                  | Uses marketing skills to iden segments and product mixes potential customers  | tify o                           | lifferent   |  |                            |  |
| •                                  | Operates as an educational e  | entre                            | preneur   |  |                            |  |
| •                                  | Promotes to customers the s expertise of staff in the organ   |                                  |   |  |                            |  |
| •                                  | Demonstrates to customers to potential of people in the organical statement of the customers to be a support of the customers to be |                                  |   |  |                            |  |
| •                                  | Knows how to close a deal   |                                  |   |  |                            |  |
| •                                  | Encourages a sharing of idea sources of new business  | is at                            | oout  |  |                            |  |
| ٠                                  | Views business processes froultimate customer prospectiv<br>an 'end-to-end' view)   |                                  |   |  |                            |  |
| Th                                 | e Ninth Capability is <u>DEVEL</u> 0  | OPS                              | AND EMF   | POWERS PEOPLE  |                            |  |
|                                    |   |                                  |   | Required Level of<br>Proficiency   |                            | Actual Level of<br>Proficiency   |
| •                                  | Deals effectively with poor pe<br>by delivering appropriate forn<br>feedback  |                                  |   |  |                            |  |
| •                                  | Identifies and implements pro<br>activities which meet staff de-<br>needs   |                                  |   |  |                            |  |
| ۰                                  | Seeks opportunities to give a coaching or mentoring   | dvic                             | e,  |  |                            |  |
| •                                  | Promotes trusting relationship staff feel valued  | os th                            | at make   |  |                            |  |
| - 1                                |   |                                  |   |  |                            | <del>.</del> . <del></del>   |
|                                    |   |                                  |   |  |                            | •  |

## Using the scale to the right, for each item listed below, please indicate the level of proficiency you believe is required to perform your current role effectively. Then indicate the actual level of proficiency you feel you now exhibit in doing your

#### Required Level of Proficiency Actual Level of Proficiency

- 8. Not Required
- 9. Low Level Required
- 10. Some Level Required
- 11. Moderate Level
- 12. High Level Required
- 13. Very High Level Required
  14. Extremely High Level
  Required
- 9. Not Relevant

- 8. None
- 9. Low 10. Some
- 11. Moderate
- 12. High
- 13. Very High
- 14. Extremely High 9. Not Relevant

|     |  | Required Level of<br>Proficiency | Actual Level of<br>Proficiency |
|-----|--|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| •   | Makes a point of acknowledging good performance  |                                  |                                |
| •   | Creates a learning environment for staff that encourages the introduction of innovative products, technologies and systems |                                  |                                |
| •   | Manages external expectations about the performance of staff under one's responsibility                                    |                                  |                                |
| •   | Actively seeks out, encourages and develops talent   |                                  |                                |
| . • | Asks people what they need in order to do their work better  |                                  |                                |

## Appendix C

## **General Staff Survey:**

This survey has been adapted from the tools used by the NCVER to meet the objectives of the research question. This research is examining: the leadership and management development efforts that are being used or that are planned to be used for building and sustaining the capabilities of College' staff who engage in managing and leading people as part of their role.

### **Informed consent:**

The researcher for this project is following the ethical guidelines issues by GLG as a criterion of the research project.

- No individuals will be identified in this report.
- Opinions will be incorporated under major themes
- The organisations will not be identified
- All interview notes will be summarized and destroyed at the end of the project
- The results of the research will be available to all participants early 2009

| Opening question  |
|---|
| Q. As you look to the future of the College, for it to continue to be competitive and   |
| innovative in the VET sector, what are the three most important leadership and  |
| management issues that you think your supervisor will face based on what you know of  |
| your manager :  |
| 1   |
| 2   |
| 3   |
| Specific areas for management and leadership development Q. In your opinion, the staff who engage in management and leadership roles in the College <u>most focus</u> on what three areas of their role in order for them to become better: 1 |
| 2   |
|   |
| 3Q. In your opinion, do you believe that your supervisor manages you and your area effectively. If not what are three areas that concern you.   |
| 1   |
| 2   |
| 3   |
| In terms of management and leadership development, what is occurring <u>at present</u> , <u>regarding your professional development</u> ?   |
|   |
|   |
| Change management Q. How does your manager introduce changes to your work area? Do you become involved and if you have ideas how are they received?   |
|   |
| Q. Are you aware of any management issues in your division or another division that you   |
| are familiar with in the next five years? Yes / No  |
| If yes, how would you change the situation to improve the operation of the College  |
|   |
|   |
| Q. DO you believe that the College and your immediate supervisor are genuinely interested in your development?  Yes / No  |

| Q. At present, what are <u>the biggest constraints</u> that you see limit your career progression in the College  |
|---|
|   |
| Q. What contemporary leadership and management practices or development do you or others in the College use that you would <u>rate as effective or better</u> ? |
| Q. Is your manager the type of leader that you would imitate to achieve good results. If so what would you do that he or she does in their role                 |
| Q. When it comes to being managed by your current manager, how you would approach their role differently.   |
|   |